

# Toronto Railway Museum Future Derailed by Toronto Hydro

## TRHA Frustrated by Utility's Reversal of Promise on Roundhouse Machine Shop

**Toronto, April 20, 2012** —The Toronto Railway Historical Association (TRHA) has appealed directly to the President and CEO of Toronto Hydro-Electric System Limited to enter into good faith discussions with the TRHA over the future of the Roundhouse Machine Shop which, since 2001, has been intended to house Toronto's Railway Museum.

The Machine Shop, an integral part of the historic Roundhouse located in Roundhouse Park on Bremner Boulevard, constitutes the only remaining space available to the TRHA on this national historically designated site to fulfill its mandate, as directed by the City of Toronto, of establishing the Toronto Railway Museum. The museum will tell the story of Toronto's rail history through a display of artifacts and images, will include a learning centre with extensive archives and will feature simulators which will allow visitors to drive a diesel locomotive through the rail lands as they were in the 1950's.

In 2008, Toronto Hydro announced its intention to construct a transformer station on the north-west portion of the Roundhouse Park immediately below the Machine Shop. At that time, Toronto Hydro stated that the transformer station would be an unmanned, underground station with the Machine Shop made available for museum purposes. The TRHA and the City of Toronto dealt with Toronto Hydro on that basis, however, in November, 2011, the utility reversed its position and declared that the transformer station would occupy 60% of the Machine Shop above grade and that any remaining space would only be made available to the TRHA on a number of occasions throughout the year and at the discretion of Toronto Hydro.

“This situation constitutes a complete reversal of the previous position of Toronto Hydro, not to mention a complete lack of transparency. Previous Toronto Hydro President and CEO David O'Brien supported and encouraged our plans for Toronto's Railway Museum, however, current CEO Anthony Haines has refused to meet with us to discuss possible alternatives,” said Orin Krivel, president of the Toronto Railway Historical Association. “We have been forced to deal repeatedly with their engineers rather than have meaningful discussions with the head of Toronto Hydro to arrive at a solution that preserves the Machine Shop for future museum use and clears the way for the transformer station.

“To date over \$22M dollars have been invested in the restoration and development of

Roundhouse Park by the City of Toronto and State Development. Our TRHA volunteers have put in over 50,000 hours of work, including the restoration of rolling stock and associated rail buildings as well as the construction and operation of the miniature railway,” said TRHA Project Spokesperson Glenn Garwood. “We understand and appreciate that Toronto Hydro must satisfy current and future electrical power requirements and, in that spirit, we have proposed two reasonable alternatives for their consideration. They have completely ignored our attempts to discuss these further with them.”

The TRHA contends that the loss of the Machine Shop space eliminates the potential for revenue generation which would allow the Railway Museum to be self-sufficient and sustainable. It will also adversely affect both proposed and current programs and attractions and will destroy the possibility for a dynamic institution that would provide the opportunity for volunteer and community involvement, public and private partnerships, educational and vocational training opportunities and research activities and a major destination for tourists and residents alike.

“If we lose the Machine Shop we lose the opportunity to complete a much needed attraction and to tell the story of Toronto’s rail history. It means we negate all the time, money, hard work and effort that have been invested in that site for more than a decade,” said Krivel. “We cannot allow Toronto Hydro to dictate the manner in which this site is managed, especially when there are acceptable alternative proposals for them to consider. There is simply too much at stake.”

**Note to Editors: Representatives of the TRHA will be available for interviews in the TRHA’s maintenance bays at the Roundhouse (immediately to the west of Steamwhistle Brewery) from 11:00 a.m. to 2:00 p.m. The miniature railway and the refurbished turntable, complete with locomotive, will also be in operation at that time.**

### **Summary of TRHA’s alternative proposals for the Machine Shop:**

Since April 2011, the TRHA has been trying to work with Toronto Hydro and their engineers to develop alternatives which would allow for the continued use of the Machine Shop by the TRHA for the establishment of the Toronto Railway Museum as well as the design and construction of the Bremner transformer station to allow Toronto Hydro to meet the electrical requirements of the City of Toronto and contribute to the renewal of their existing facilities. In short, the TRHA has consistently worked towards a solution which would truly be mutually beneficial and we have provided viable alternatives to Toronto Hydro to that end.

The first option proposed by the TRHA makes use of a parcel of land which is immediately adjacent to the proposed transformer station site and we have been meeting with the City of Toronto Real Estate and Facilities Management Services, since July

2011, to facilitate the transfer of this additional land to Toronto Hydro for their future capacity and use through a “lease-to-own” scheme. This option would allow for the construction of the transformer station below-grade as originally proposed by Toronto Hydro.

The use of this additional land could provide Toronto Hydro with up to 74,000 sq.ft. of additional space for its current proposal and any future expansion needs. Although the land is currently subject to multiple easements, the City of Toronto has indicated that they are willing to work with the TRHA and Toronto Hydro to remove or mitigate existing easements.

It is important to note that this land will have little value once the transformer station is constructed as it will be bordered by the transformer station to the west, the Metro Toronto Convention Centre to the north and east and Lakeshore Boulevard to the south.

The TRHA also proposed that Toronto Hydro locate those elements currently housed within the Machine Shop in a one storey, above-grade structure which could be incorporated into the above-grade structure currently proposed for the exhaust and ventilation shafts at the southwest corner of the transformer station site. This option would allow Toronto Hydro to maintain their parking and access to the station distinct from the other businesses and facilities on the site and would, again, avoid the extremely detrimental measures that Toronto Hydro is currently proposing for the historic fabric of the Machine Shop.

Those elements currently proposed for the above-grade space within the Machine Shop are physically distinct from the remainder of the transformer station below grade: the relocation of these elements does NOT constitute a major design change and most certainly does not jeopardize the project. Toronto Hydro has stated that the project is too far advanced to allow for any revision. The TRHA originally proposed these options to Toronto Hydro in July 2011 but no effort was made to consider our alternatives although the transformer station design, to our knowledge, has not been finalized. Toronto Hydro has stated repeatedly that they have invested too much capital to date to consider alternatives. The TRHA rejects that argument and notes that this is a situation of Toronto Hydro’s own making.

**For More Information - Visit [www.trha.ca](http://www.trha.ca)**

Glenn Garwood, Project Spokesperson, TRHA, 416-464-6235, [g.garwood@yahoo.ca](mailto:g.garwood@yahoo.ca)

## JOHN STREET ROUNDHOUSE

# HISTORY

Construction of the John Street Roundhouse, built for the Canadian Pacific Railway Company, began in 1929 and was completed after the demolition of the existing CPR Roundhouse in 1931. The site includes the 32-stall Roundhouse and Machine Shop, adjacent to Stall #25, as well as the turntable, water tower and sand and coal loader. Built for the servicing and repair of passenger steam engines, the John Street Roundhouse was the first and only roundhouse in Canada to use the "direct-steam process". This technology allowed an engine to drop its firebox outside of the Roundhouse and enter the Roundhouse under the power of the remaining steam. Once inside the Roundhouse, the engine would be connected to the steam lines within the Roundhouse. The steam which was generated at a plant located at York Street and Lakeshore Boulevard also provided steam heat to Union Station, the Royal York Hotel and, later, the Canadian National Railway Spadina Yard. The "direct-steam" technology allowed for improved maintenance and fuel consumption, improved the conditions within the Roundhouse due to the reduction of the smoke produced and the danger inherent in engines which retained their fireboxes during servicing and allowed for much faster servicing of the steam engines. The Machine Shop was vital to the function of the Roundhouse and contained the lathes, drills, boiler tank, boiler washer room, compressor room, fan room, blacksmith shop and workers' facilities. The existing compressors and electrical panels remain in situ while much of the other equipment remains in storage.

After World War II and the decline in passenger service, the passenger yards were converted to allow for freight repair and the Roundhouse was adapted to service diesel-fired steam engines after the use of coal-fired steam engines came to an end during the 1950's. During the 1960's and 1970's, a number of the site's obsolete buildings were removed. The last diesel engine was serviced at the Roundhouse in 1982 and the facility was ultimately closed in 1986. The Canadian Pacific Railway Company donated the John Street Roundhouse to the City of Toronto in 1988 for its adaptive re-use as a municipal Railway Museum.



The John Street Roundhouse was designated a National Historic Site of Canada in 1990, notable as “the best surviving example of a roundhouse in Canada”.

*While the Board believed that the Roundhouse itself was of sufficient interest to merit federal designation, it emphasized the fact that the Roundhouse was a part of a railyard complex increased its significance and it urged those entrusted with the future of the Railway Property to strive to ensure that the Roundhouse survives in the context of the important companion structures that surround it.*

*Historic Sites and Monuments Board of Canada, Minutes, February 1990*

*The Board first noted that it had only recommended the commemoration, on grounds of national historic and architectural significance, of the John Street Roundhouse, in Toronto, arguably the finest surviving roundhouse in Canada.*

*Historic Sites and Monuments Board of Canada, Minutes March 1991*

*The John Street Roundhouse was designated a national historic site in 1990, as the best surviving example of a roundhouse in Canada. The site's heritage values include the roundhouse and machine shop annex, a turntable, coal and sanding tower, and water tower....*

*Historic Sites and Monuments Board of Canada, Minutes, 1999*

The Commemorative Integrity Statement, January 2005, identifies the values of the Historic Site as follows:

- It is the best surviving example of a roundhouse in Canada
- It enhances the understanding of the organization and functional processes of a railway roundhouse operation
- The place survives in relatively good and complete condition
- Its industrial character
- Its integral relationship to the age of railway steam locomotion in twentieth-century Canada and the introduction of direct-steaming technology
- It speaks to the development and expansion of Toronto during the apogee of the railway era in twentieth-century Canada



Specific to the Roundhouse-Machine Shop Building, the Commemorative Integrity Statement identifies the values of the built structure as follows:

- Its interior layout – the scale and volume of open spaces – speaks to its industrial character and function
- Certain features of the building – such as the rear knock-out walls, the tracks and drop pits, the machine shop and elements of the direct-steam system – speak in detail to the repair function and processes for which the structure was built
- The extent and completeness of surviving hardware and other operational details, such as door mechanisms, pipes, duct work, direct steaming lines, the air compressor, and other in situ machinery

According to the Commemorative Integrity Statement, the built structures are not considered to be impaired or under threat when “the massing, form, and fabric of their character-defining elements are respected; new and evolving uses respect the machinery, features and hardware that enhance understanding of the industrial processes of the site” and “their national significance is effectively communicated to the public”.

In addition to the characteristics and values of the site and built structures, the Commemorative Integrity Statement identifies the resources connected to the Roundhouse, including archival material, tools and machinery, which are classified as Level One Historic Objects valuable as representative of the operations and functional processes.

In 1996, the CPR John Street Roundhouse was designated by the City of Toronto under By-law No. 1996-0385. The by-law identifies the Roundhouse, including the Machine Shop, turntable, sand and coal loader, and water tower for architectural and historical reasons as “important surviving reminders of steam technology and the role of rail transportation in the City of Toronto”. The Roundhouse, including the Machine Shop, is also identified as a “contributing building” of the Union Station Heritage Conservation District: a “contributing building” being one which contributes to the character of the district and/or is historically, architecturally and/or culturally significant.

The City of Toronto entered into the Hydro Purchase Option Agreement with Ontario Hydro (Hydro One Networks) in 1992: this agreement allowed Ontario Hydro the option to purchase the land adjacent to the CPR Roundhouse (below the Machine Shop), known as the Hydro Option Lands, until 2013. In 2008, Ontario Hydro, now Hydro One, notified the City of Toronto of its intention to purchase the land and construct a transformer station at

this location. As a requirement of the Hydro Purchase Option Agreement, the City of Toronto was required to transfer the land encumbrance free: therefore, the City of Toronto repealed and amended the designation by-law to remove references to the Machine Shop to allow for this transfer. Although the revised by-law No. 1143-2008 has removed references to the Machine Shop, its importance to the interpretation and communication of the Roundhouse and rail history is not in question. **The Machine Shop, an integral part of the Roundhouse, remains architecturally, culturally and historically significant at both a local and national level; this significance is not subject to revision.**

## TORONTO RAILWAY MUSEUM

# HISTORY

The Toronto Railway Historical Association is a registered charitable organization which was established in 2001; its mandate, as directed by the City of Toronto, is the promotion and establishment of a meaningful Railway Museum at the Roundhouse Park to celebrate the contributions of the rail lands to the success of Toronto through the industrial era. In addition to the establishment of the Railway Museum, the TRHA has developed a vision and mission statement which includes:

- **The communication of the history of railways in Toronto**
- **The identification and celebration of the creative, technological, social and industrial achievements of Torontonians who have contributed to the development of railways in Canada**
- **To assemble, conserve and preserve artifacts and objects relating to the development of the railway industry**
- **To make available the resources of the TRHA and Railway Museum to Canada and the world via internet technology**

In 2001, the Toronto Railway Historical Committee (predecessor to the TRHA) began the development of the program to guide the establishment of the Railway Museum: this original "vision document" anticipated the use of display sites outside of the Roundhouse site in addition to the Machine Shop and five stalls. Due to outside interests, these additional sites are no longer available to the TRHA: these sites would have accounted for thousands of

square feet of space. At present, the TRHA occupies only three stalls of the original 32 stalls which are used for the restoration of rolling stock. **The Machine Shop constitutes the only remaining space in the Roundhouse Park available for use by the TRHA and our volunteers.** In addition to the museum function, the use of the Machine Shop by the TRHA and our volunteers is vital to the continued success and function of the Roundhouse Park and is critical for the implementation of the following programs and activities:

- The Machine Shop will function as the starting point for all historical railway tours, including Union Station and RailLand tours, school and bus tours
- The TSSA certification required for volunteers to run the mini-steam engines will take place within the Machine Shop – the loss of this attraction would have an incredibly negative effect on the Roundhouse Park, in addition to the loss of income generated by the attraction
- The restoration work which takes place within Stalls 15-17 will be coordinated at the Machine Shop: currently, all staff and volunteer functions are temporarily housed in the Restoration Stalls which detracts from the restoration work to be done
- The rail simulators, including the restored Canadian National FP9, will be located in the Machine Shop, providing the public with an opportunity to experience rail operations in Toronto from the Engineer's perspective
- Space within the Machine Shop will be dedicated to the archiving, interpretation and display of rail artifacts, documents and equipment, including the original Machine Shop equipment and blacksmith shop
- Public lecture series and educational and safety programs will be offered at the Machine Shop, including programs organized by Operation Lifesaver
- The establishment of a Railway Library to provide research facilities for rail enthusiasts and academics in addition to partnerships with other libraries, educational institutions and archives to create travelling exhibits and collections
- To foster research into rail history in the Toronto area
- A gift shop and bookstore to provide tourists and visitors the opportunity to purchase postcards, posters and books to enhance and reinforce their experience at the Rail Museum and Roundhouse Park and broaden the knowledge of Toronto rail history
- The programs and activities outlined by the TRHA are completely in keeping with those offered at other comparable Railway Museums: indeed, the programme prepared by the TRHA for the Machine Shop is much more modest given the site restraints

To date, **TRHA volunteers have completed over 50,000 hours of work**, including the restoration of rolling stock and associated rail buildings such as Cabin D and the relocated Don Station as well as the construction and operation of the mini-rail, an attraction which has proved incredibly popular with visitors. It is important to note that much of this work was





completed by the volunteers within the Machine Shop, including the construction of the miniature railway; not only has the Machine Shop been critical to the work of the volunteers but it has also been central to the development of the Roundhouse Park as a whole.

During its operation, the Machine Shop functioned as the “heart” of the Roundhouse and it truly remains so today.

## *BREMNER TRANSFORMER STATION*

### BACKGROUND

In 1992, the City of Toronto entered into an agreement with Hydro One Networks Inc. which allowed Hydro One the option to purchase the land west of the Roundhouse Park for the future construction of a Transformer Station. As a requirement of this agreement, the City of Toronto repealed and amended the designation by-law in March 2008 to remove any reference to the Machine Shop to allow for the transfer of the lands to Hydro One with all encumbrances removed. Shortly after the amendment of the designation by-law, the subject land and the Transformer Station project were transferred from Hydro One to Toronto Hydro-Electric System Limited. Due to the heritage and cultural significance of the site, meetings were held with the TRHA, the City of Toronto and Toronto Hydro to ensure that the site would not be adversely affected by the project. Fully aware of the position and intent of the City of Toronto and the TRHA, Toronto Hydro stated that the transformer station would be an **unmanned, underground station with the Machine Shop made available to the City of Toronto for museum purposes**: indeed, Toronto Hydro maintained that the station would be built below grade until early 2011.

In April 2011, Toronto Hydro issued its Notice of Study Commencement for the Class Environmental Assessment for the Bremner Transformer Station and Machine Shop. As a stakeholder in the Roundhouse Park site, the TRHA was involved in the initial public consultations as well as subsequent meetings with Toronto Hydro and IBI Group Engineers to review the proposed project. Despite the assurances provided by Toronto Hydro at these earlier meetings, the proposal outlined in the Study Report includes the disassembly and re-assembly of the Machine Shop to allow for the below-grade construction of the transformer station as well as the allocation of space above-grade within the Machine Shop for Toronto



Hydro use; this appropriation of space was done without previous consultation with the TRHA. The Study Report also noted the requirement for fire-separating construction which would have an extremely negative impact on the heritage fabric of the Machine Shop as well as its relationship to the Roundhouse subsequent to re-assembly.

Although not noted in the Study Report, it was later confirmed to us by IBI Group Engineers, at a meeting in July 2011, that the Bremner Transformer Station must be a post-disaster building as defined by the Ontario Building Code. In order to conform to the requirements of the Ontario Building Code, the Transformer Station must be designed and constructed to withstand earthquake loads and effects per OBC Part 4. This requirement will have a substantial impact on the design of the Transformer Station and its relationship to both the Machine Shop and Roundhouse; this will also have an incredibly negative effect on the heritage integrity of the Machine Shop. Based on our concerns regarding the Study Report, the TRHA requested a Part II Order from the Ministry of the Environment in August 2011 to require an Individual Environmental Assessment in order to compel Toronto Hydro to fully disclose their proposed methods of achieving the required fire-separating and seismic construction required for the Transformer Station in relation to the Machine Shop and Roundhouse.

It has since been confirmed to us that the entire Machine Shop is to be re-assembled as a post-disaster structure. We very specifically questioned the re-assembly of the Machine Shop as a post-disaster structure and were assured by Toronto Hydro that the required construction of the building would not compromise its heritage integrity. Despite these assurances, we do not believe that the Machine Shop can be re-assembled to meet post-disaster requirements in a manner that is in keeping with good heritage practice, especially as befits a site of national significance. Toronto Hydro also confirmed to us that they had allocated approximately 50% of the Ground Floor and corresponding space on a mezzanine level for their use; this constitutes even more space than was previously indicated. This reduces the space remaining for the TRHA and Railway Museum to substantially less than 25% of the space that we had hoped for; furthermore, this space would only be available to the TRHA on a number of occasions throughout the year and at the discretion of Toronto Hydro.

This constitutes a complete reversal of the position of Toronto Hydro at the initial proposal stage when Toronto Hydro specifically solicited the support of the TRHA for their proposal to disassemble and re-assemble the Machine Shop to allow for the construction of what was then conveyed to us to be an unmanned and underground transformer station which would allow the TRHA to utilize the above-grade space within the Machine Shop for the establishment of the Railway Museum. Documentation which outlines the contents of the



meetings held in 2008 with the City of Toronto, the TRHA and Toronto Hydro clearly indicates that Toronto Hydro was aware of the intended use of the Machine Shop to house the Railway Museum as expressed by the City of Toronto and the TRHA. There obviously came a point during the development of their proposal when Toronto Hydro felt it necessary to allocate space within the Machine Shop for their own use yet they chose not to inform either the TRHA or the City of Toronto.

We were contacted by Toronto Hydro in late November 2011 to inform us that they had issued their revised and final Heritage Impact Assessment to their website. We have reviewed the revised HIA and have very serious concerns about a number of proposed measures, as follows:

- The requirement for a **300mm (12") expansion joint between the Roundhouse and the re-assembled Machine Shop** which will irreparably alter the relationship between the Machine Shop and the Roundhouse and, as such, does not comply with the standard of reversibility which the HIA specifically references
- The proposed construction of a **510mm thick (20") reinforced concrete exterior wall** which would utilize the original salvaged brick (where possible) as a veneer on the exterior and interior; it is our opinion that this irreparably destroys the integrity of the Machine Shop
- The construction measures proposed in this latest HIA are substantially different from those outlined in the previously issued assessments on which the TRHA based its objections and to which the Part II Order responds:
  - This effectively prevents the TRHA from responding to and, obviously, objecting to the actual proposed construction now that it has been resolved
  - We feel that Toronto Hydro was premature in submitting their Environmental Assessment and Site Plan Approval applications and have effectively circumvented the approvals process
  - The haste in which they have approached the approvals process to date leaves us with concerns that, should further issues arise, they would not be addressed in an appropriate, transparent manner
  - Most importantly, it is our opinion that the measures proposed in this latest HIA are even more detrimental to the heritage integrity of the Machine Shop and Roundhouse than those previously proposed and communicated

Since April 2011, the TRHA has been working to provide alternatives to Toronto Hydro which would avoid the necessity of any fire-separation and/or post-disaster construction which we feel will be detrimental to the integrity of the heritage fabric of the Machine Shop as well as to reduce the amount of space required by Toronto Hydro within the Machine

Shop which negates the viability of the Railway Museum and the continued work of the TRHA. To that end, the TRHA has attended numerous meetings with the City of Toronto and Toronto Hydro in an attempt to secure additional property for Toronto Hydro's use. The City of Toronto, specifically Culture and Real Estate Services, have expressed their willingness to continue to work with us to find an alternative to the current Toronto Hydro proposal. We are continuing these negotiations with the City in an attempt to secure land adjacent to the Transformer Station land which would provide Toronto Hydro with up to 74,000 square feet of additional space.

The revised Heritage Impact Assessment states that, in addition to Toronto Hydro, Hydro One has also allocated space for their use both above-grade, within the Machine Shop, and below-grade; the above-grade space within the Machine Shop now constitutes 50-60% of the Ground Floor, an even greater area than was previously communicated to us. The revised HIA suggests that the allocation of space within the Machine Shop was necessitated by a lack of space below grade. This assertion is absolutely outrageous given that the option to secure additional land immediately adjacent to the current site has been available to Toronto Hydro for years. The Minutes of Meeting #19 of the City of Toronto Government Management Committee (November 21, 2008) indicate that the Committee had directed the City's CCO to determine any necessary adjustments to the boundaries of the Transformer Station lands. Most importantly, Toronto Hydro had previously reviewed this option as a means to avoid the disassembly and re-assembly of the Machine Shop but abandoned this option due to the encumbrances which we are currently working with the City to remove.

Despite the cooperation of the TRHA and continued willingness of the City of Toronto to work towards a successful resolution, Toronto Hydro has indicated that they have no intention of considering this additional land parcel even if it were available immediately, **effectively eliminating any opportunity to establish the Toronto Railway Museum and removing the Machine Shop from the public realm forever.** The TRHA has continually approached this process in good faith and has made every effort to present alternatives to Toronto Hydro which in no way negate their ability to construct a transformer station which meets their requirements; indeed, we feel that our proposals will allow for Toronto Hydro to meet their future expansion needs as well. Unfortunately, the current Toronto Hydro proposal completely destroys the ability of the TRHA to fulfill their mandate from the City of Toronto to establish a meaningful Railway Museum and, we believe, irreparably damages the heritage integrity of a building of national significance. It has become clear to us that Toronto Hydro was never willing to work with the TRHA to find a solution that would be mutually beneficial. We are compelled, therefore, to take all steps available to us to protect the integrity of the Machine Shop and Roundhouse and our shared heritage.



## TORONTO RAILWAY MUSEUM IMPACT

The consequences of the current proposal by Toronto Hydro to the Toronto Railway Historical Association and the Roundhouse site are absolutely devastating. The loss of the space within the Machine Shop eliminates any possibility for the establishment of the Toronto Railway Museum and negates over 10 years of planning and effort on the part of the TRHA and our volunteers, not to mention the explicit intent of the Canadian Pacific Railway Company when they donated the Roundhouse to the City of Toronto over 25 years ago.

As the Machine Shop constitutes the only remaining space available to the TRHA staff and volunteers, the loss of this space will adversely affect both the proposed and current programs and attractions, many of which have been developed in partnership with other agencies, compounding the negative affect that this current proposal will have. As noted, the success of the Roundhouse Park to date owes much to the efforts of the TRHA's volunteers; unfortunately, with little or no hope of the continued growth of the Railway Museum and its related programs, it is unlikely that many of them will remain committed. To eliminate the implementation of the Railway Museum and jeopardize the further development of the Roundhouse Park negates the efforts of these volunteers and irreparably damages an incredibly valuable heritage site. The ability to present and interpret the history of the Roundhouse in keeping with the National Historic Site Objectives is dependent upon the ability of the TRHA and our volunteers to interact with and engage visitors to the Railway Museum: the anticipated loss of volunteer involvement limits the possibilities for display and eliminates the potential for meaningful interpretation. In 2011, **the TRHA was awarded the Community Heritage Award by Heritage Toronto** for our commitment to the celebration of rail history and the development of the Roundhouse Park: to destroy the only remaining opportunity for the continued work of the TRHA in the face of such recognition is an insult.

Furthermore, the loss of the Machine Shop and its related programs will eliminate the potential for revenue generation which would allow the Railway Museum to be **self-sufficient and sustainable and set a precedent for the future development of City-owned or operated museums**. The TRHA and the City of Toronto remain committed to

the establishment of the Toronto Railway Museum: in fact, the TRHA and the City of Toronto recently finalized the details for the TRHA's operating budget, including funding for a temporary exhibit to be housed in Stall #17. It was the intent of the TRHA that this temporary exhibit would generate interest and excitement for the upcoming Railway Museum: it would be an absolute disgrace for the TRHA to be denied yet another opportunity to establish the Railway Museum due to the actions of an organization with such a limited agenda. This proposal by Toronto Hydro does not represent a legitimate alternative or attempt at adaptive re-use: the decision to appropriate space within the Machine Shop and eliminate the potential to establish the Toronto Railway Museum was made by Toronto Hydro with no direction from or consultation with the City of Toronto or the TRHA.

Without the space that we have relied upon to support an effective program, the existing artifacts, documents and other collection items currently in the possession of the TRHA will have to remain in storage at the City of Toronto Archives with little to no possibility for their future display and interpretation. Additionally, the TRHA may have to refuse the donation of any new items which could lead to the disposal of valuable pieces of our rail heritage which have not yet been discovered. The existing compressor and jacks, presently in situ in the Machine Shop, may never be available for presentation or research purposes and will limit the effective communication of the repair function of the site, to which the Machine Shop was central. It is simply not possible to communicate the function of the Roundhouse without the ability to present the Machine Shop and its machinery and equipment in some semblance of their original setting; the Toronto Hydro proposal destroys that possibility completely. It has been suggested that the TRHA can effectively establish the Railway Museum in the space that remains within the Restoration Stalls, possibly utilizing the catwalks above. Accessibility issues notwithstanding, this does not constitute nearly enough space without the rolling stock much less with the continuation of the restoration work. Similarly, any remaining space within the Machine Shop, possibly made available by Toronto Hydro to the TRHA four to five times a year, would allow for little beyond photographic display, limiting the opportunity for communication to static exhibition, cursory at best. Not only is this contrary to the "vision document", prepared by the TRHA, which envisioned a dynamic institution that would provide the opportunity for volunteer and community involvement, public and private partnerships, educational and vocational training opportunities and research activities, it utterly diminishes the importance of the Roundhouse site and its related history. It is important to reiterate that the programs and activities outlined by the TRHA are completely in keeping with those offered at other comparable Railway Museums: indeed, the programme prepared by the TRHA for the Machine Shop is much more modest given the site constraints.

Not only does the current Toronto Hydro proposal eliminate any opportunity for the TRHA to utilize the Machine Shop for the communication and interpretation of the history of the Roundhouse site and railways in Toronto, it compromises the continued success and function of the Roundhouse Park in its entirety. The loss of the Machine Shop and the resulting elimination of the Railway Museum are contrary to the National Historic Site Objectives as outlined in the Commemorative Integrity Statement and, as such, are completely inappropriate to the management of a National Historic Site:

- The opportunity to foster the knowledge and appreciation of Canada's past, as related to its rail history, will be eliminated
- The current proposal does nothing to ensure that the commemorative integrity of the Roundhouse site is protected and presented for present and future generations: indeed, this current proposal jeopardizes the commemorative and physical integrity of the Machine Shop and Roundhouse forever

The continued use of the Machine Shop by the TRHA is absolutely vital to the establishment of the Toronto Railway Museum.

## *MACHINE SHOP*

## IMPACT

Although the loss of the Toronto Railway Museum is cause enough for concern, the impact that the current Toronto Hydro proposal will have on the integrity of the Machine Shop and Roundhouse is also devastating. As noted previously, the TRHA has significant concerns regarding the measures proposed in the final Heritage Impact Assessment, specifically the 300mm (12") expansion joint between the Machine Shop and Roundhouse and the 500mm (20") reinforced concrete exterior wall which would utilize reclaimed brick (where possible) as a veneer only. It is our opinion that **these measures utterly and irreparably destroy the heritage integrity of both the Machine Shop and Roundhouse.** The revised Heritage Impact Assessment asserts that the re-assembly of the Machine Shop maintains the visual continuity of the site which it identifies as one of the most significant heritage attributes of the complex. Not only does this approach attempt to limit the significance of the Machine Shop to its exterior appearance, contrary to the Commemorative Integrity Statement which notes the scale and volume of interior spaces, it also fails to recognize the



importance that the Machine Shop had to the function of the Roundhouse during its use. Again, it is simply not possible to communicate the repair function of the Roundhouse without the Machine Shop and its artifacts. By way of mitigation, the revised HIA states that the re-assembly of the Machine Shop will re-instate the original physical relationship of the Machine Shop to the Roundhouse; this clearly ignores the effect of the proposed 300mm expansion joint which makes this re-instatement impossible. The revised HIA repeatedly references the standard of reversibility despite the fact that there is simply no way to return the Machine Shop to its found condition without complete disassembly, even were Toronto Hydro and Hydro One to abandon the transformer station at a future date. Although the precedent for disassembly and re-assembly was set during the construction of the Metro Toronto Convention Centre, these two situations are NOT comparable. While the Roundhouse stalls were disassembled to allow for the construction of the MTCC, the stalls were ultimately re-assembled to suit the original condition and construction: the re-assembly of the Machine Shop, proposed by Toronto Hydro, will irreparably alter its original construction and destroy its connection to the Roundhouse. A precedent for this level of inappropriate intervention cannot be set, especially in the context of a nationally designated heritage site.

It is completely unacceptable that the management of the Roundhouse site has effectively been left to the discretion of Toronto Hydro and that its' continued integrity is subject to the current proposal which was developed in haste and convenience. The adaptive re-use of the John Street Roundhouse for the Leon's furniture store was completed in keeping with the best heritage practices as expected and appropriate for a site of this importance and is rightly deserving of the awards and acclaim that it has garnered. To allow the Machine Shop to be altered in the manner currently proposed by Toronto Hydro will most certainly detract from the successful re-use of the Roundhouse and call into question the manner in which this site has been managed. It is our opinion that the re-assembly of the Machine Shop as a post-disaster structure will destroy its heritage integrity and clearly does not respect the "significant and irreplaceable legacy" of the site. It is critical that we do not waste this one opportunity to develop the Machine Shop and Roundhouse Park in a manner that is representative of the best of heritage and cultural stewardship.

Toronto Hydro makes much of its obligation to provide power to the citizens of Toronto: however, as a wholly-owned affiliate of Toronto Hydro Corporation to which the City of Toronto is the sole shareholder, Toronto Hydro also has an obligation to act in a manner that is in the public's greater interest. The construction of the transformer station at the expense of the Toronto Railway Museum and the continued development of the Roundhouse Park is most definitely not in the public's interest. The TRHA is not suggesting



that Toronto Hydro abandon the transformer station project: the alternative proposed by the TRHA would allow for the construction of the transformer station while maintaining the Machine Shop for the establishment of the Railway Museum. Publicly, Toronto Hydro has been very adamant about the need to upgrade and modernize its facilities and warns of service disruptions and power outages yet its current proposal utilizes an 80-year old heritage building to house the control rooms, the “brain of the station” according to Toronto Hydro.

The requirement for additional space within the Machine Shop for both Toronto Hydro and Hydro One increased with every subsequent iteration of the design: we have to wonder how much space will ultimately be required and what further measures Toronto Hydro will propose for the Machine Shop when it is no longer deemed to be large enough. Toronto Hydro seems determined to house elements of the transformer station within the Machine Shop although it seems to make no sense to utilize approximately 12,000 square feet of space within the Machine Shop when the additional land that we are proposing could provide Toronto Hydro with up to 74,000 square feet of space. This additional space will allow for any further design changes as well as meeting any potential future requirements for expansion or modification due to new equipment or technologies. The haste with which Toronto Hydro and its engineers have approached the design and approvals process to date leaves us with little doubt that further changes can be expected; indeed, we would be quite surprised if the design did not change.

It has been suggested that the project is too far advanced to allow Toronto Hydro to consider alternatives. While this certainly makes for a compelling argument, the reality is that Toronto Hydro was not forthcoming with its requirements months ago. The TRHA began meeting with Toronto Hydro and its engineers in April 2011 with the hope of maintaining enough space within the Machine Shop to allow for the establishment of the Railway Museum: however, we were not informed that the Machine Shop would not be available to us, save at Toronto Hydro’s discretion, until November 2011. If the TRHA, with the cooperation of Toronto Hydro, had been able to begin our negotiations for the additional land with the City of Toronto, we believe that we would have an agreement in place which would allow the TRHA to establish the Toronto Railway Museum within the Machine Shop and Toronto Hydro to construct the transformer station below grade. Of course, the recent decision by the Ontario Energy Board to deny Toronto Hydro’s request for a rate increase to fund the modernization of its facilities might seem to support the argument that no further capital can be committed to this project. Again, a compelling argument but we would question the decision to proceed to this stage in the design and approvals process when the OEB decision on the rate increase was still months away.

Toronto Hydro has repeatedly stated that too much capital has been committed to the project and that, due to strict regulatory requirements, they must be prudent in their use of funds. In response to this, we would like to point out that over \$22 million dollars have been invested in the restoration and development of Roundhouse Park to date by the City of Toronto and State Building Group. The time and money invested in the transformer station project is beyond negligible when compared to the amount of time, planning, effort, and capital invested in Roundhouse Park to date. While the alternatives proposed by the TRHA do not affect Toronto Hydro's ability to construct the transformer station in order to upgrade and modernize its facilities and equipment, the current proposal by Toronto Hydro jeopardizes any further development of Roundhouse Park and destroys the value of all investment to date and the continued work and purpose of the TRHA and its volunteers. Toronto Hydro claims that, by allowing the TRHA the use of the Machine Shop, it would be "subsidizing" the TRHA and the Railway Museum: this is patently untrue. The disassembly and re-assembly of the Machine Shop was proposed by THESL to allow for the excavation required to construct the transformer station: not only does this measure have no relation to the eventual use of the Machine Shop, it was proposed well in advance of the appropriation of space within the Machine Shop by Toronto Hydro and is, therefore, not contingent upon the dedicated use of the Machine Shop by Toronto Hydro. By allowing the TRHA the use of the Machine Shop, Toronto Hydro will simply be honouring the commitment that it made to both the TRHA and the City of Toronto.

Despite the resistance that we have encountered to date, the TRHA will continue to make every effort to protect the Machine Shop and Roundhouse for the use of future generations. To that end, the TRHA remains committed in our efforts to obtain the additional land and to provide Toronto Hydro with a viable alternative to its current proposal. We are more than willing to support Toronto Hydro, as required, to secure the commitment of any jurisdiction or agency necessary in order to enable them to take advantage of this opportunity to arrive at a successful solution that is beneficial to both the TRHA and Toronto Hydro: a solution which will secure the reputation of the John Street Roundhouse as the premier railway site in Canada while setting the precedent for the successful integration of the transformer station within the downtown core.

**THIS TRULY IS THE LAST OPPORTUNITY TO PRESERVE THE INTEGRITY OF THE JOHN STREET ROUNDHOUSE NATIONAL HISTORIC SITE, THE "BEST SURVIVING EXAMPLE OF A ROUNDHOUSE IN CANADA".**

## Contact:

Glenn Garwood, Project Spokesperson, TRHA, 416-464-6235, [g.garwood@yahoo.ca](mailto:g.garwood@yahoo.ca)